

## **The Concept of Mental Disorder: SPRING 2017 (7AAN2003)**

Credits: 20 units

Tutor: Derek Bolton

Office: Henry Wellcome Building, Room 2.05, Institute of Psychiatry, Psychology and Neuroscience, Denmark Hill Campus.

Email: derek.bolton@kcl.ac.uk

Teachers: Derek Bolton, Norman Poole, Mohammed Abouelleil Rashed

Consultation Hours: TBD\*

Lecture Hours: TBD

\* Please note: since Prof. Bolton is based at Denmark Hill, rather than at the Strand, you might prefer just to email him—or the other two teachers in the course—rather than trying to get along to his consultation hours in person: derek.bolton@kcl.ac.uk, m.rashed@ucl.ac.uk, norman.poole@gmail.com.

### **COURSE DESCRIPTION**

This course will critically appraise several main approaches to the concept of mental disorder. First, the critiques of mainstream psychiatry, beginning in the 1960s and still current, mainly to the effect that normal distress or social deviance is being inappropriately pathologized; second, conceptualisations of mental disorder in the standard psychiatry diagnostic manuals of the World Health Organisation and the American Psychiatric Association; and third, ‘naturalist’ approaches to the definition of mental disorder that invoke population statistical or evolutionary theory based norms. Distinctive features include coverage of various approaches to this multi-faceted problem.

### **OBJECTIVES**

By the end of the module, students will be able to demonstrate intellectual, transferable and practicable skills appropriate to a level-7 module. In particular they will be able to demonstrate:

1. Understanding of contemporary controversies about the nature and extent of mental disorder, conceptualisations used in mainstream psychiatry, and theoretical definitions in terms of human nature.
2. Knowledge of the main positions in the philosophy of psychiatry relevant to the definition of mental disorder.
3. Ability to assess and develop these positions
4. Ability to exercise their powers of intellectual criticism by critically commenting upon the views discussed
5. Ability to relate material from the philosophy of psychiatry to other branches of philosophy, such as philosophy of psychology or philosophy of medicine
6. Ability to form philosophical views of their own which they are prepared to defend or amend in light of criticism.
7. Ability to read closely and gain understanding of relevant texts.

## ASSESSMENT

*Formative Assessment:* 1 x 2000 - 3000 word essay

Essay due by 16:00 on 31 March 2017. Please send your essay in the first instance to Derek Bolton, derek.bolton@kcl.ac.uk, who will direct it to the appropriate module teacher for feedback.

*Summative Assessment:* 1 x 4000 word essay

Essay due by Wednesday 26 April 2017, 16:00

## READING

The readings for the course are separated into the following two categories:

*Core Reading:* reading that everyone who wants proper coverage of the subject must read.

*Further Reading:* additional readings to help further develop your views on a particular subject.

Many of the readings for the course can be found online and some in the following collection of essays:

- The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy and Psychiatry. Edited W. K. M. Fulford, Martin Davies, Richard G.T. Gipps, George Graham, John Z. Sadler, G. Stanghellini, & Tim Thornton. Oxford University Press, 2013.

The following are helpful texts – book length – with broad coverage of the issues, the first covering the '60s developments and the second updated:

- Sedgewick, P. (1982) *Psycho Politics: Laing, Foucault, Goffman, Szasz, and the future of mass psychiatry*. Harper and Row: New York
- Bolton D. (2008). *What is mental disorder? An essay in philosophy, science and values*. Oxford University Press

## PROVISIONAL SCHEDULE

### **Week 1: Introduction To The Problems And The Module**

No specific reading. Students are welcome to prepare for the module as a whole and this sessions using the texts above or for week 2 below.

### **Week 2: Is Mental Disorder Being Over-Diagnosed? 1960s Critiques To The Present.**

Norman Poole

*Core Reading*

- Szasz, L. (1960). The Myth of Mental Illness. 15(2), *The American Psychologist*.
- Sedgewick, P. (1982). *Psycho Politics: Laing, Foucault, Goffman, Szasz, and the Future of Mass Psychiatry*. Harper & Row: New York. Chapter 1.

- Bolton D. (2008). What is mental disorder? An essay in philosophy, science and values. Oxford University Press. Sections 2.6 and 3.1.
- Charland, L. (2013). Why Psychiatry Should Fear Medicalisation. In *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy & Psychiatry*.

#### Further reading

- Kutchins H & Kirk S (1999). *Making us crazy: DSM- The Psychiatric Bible and the Creation of Mental Disorders*. NY: NY Free Press. Chapter 1. Diagnosis
- Hacking, I. (1999) The social construction of what ...? Harvard. Chapter 4 Madness: biological or constructed?

### **Week 3: Social Identity And Challenges To The 'Mental Disorder' Label**

Mohammed Rashed

#### Core reading

- Schrader, S., Jones, N., and Shattell, M. (2013). Mad Pride: Reflections on Sociopolitical Identity and Mental Diversity in the Context of Culturally Competent Psychiatric Care. *Issues in Mental Health Nursing* 34: 62-64.
- Bracken, P., and Thomas, P. (2013). Challenges to the Modernist Identity of Psychiatry: User Empowerment & Recovery. In *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy & Psychiatry*
- Radden, J. (2012). Recognition Rights, Mental Health Consumers and Reconstructive Cultural Semantics. *Philosophy, Ethics and Humanities in Medicine* 7(6): 1-8.

#### Further reading

- Gorman, R. (2013). Mad Nation? Thinking Through Race, Class, and Mad Identity Politics. In *Mad Matters: A Critical Reader in Canadian Mad Studies*.
- Dellar, R., Curtis, T., and Leslie, E. (2003). *Mad Pride: A Celebration of Mad Culture*. Truro: Chipmunkpublishing.

### **Week 4: Folk Psychiatry: The Case Of Capgras Delusion**

Norman Poole

#### Core Reading

- Boyer P. (2011) Intuitive expectations and the detection of mental disorder: A cognitive background to folk-psychiatry, *Philosophical Psychology*, 24, 95-118, DOI: 10.1080/09515089.2010.529049
- Haslam H. (2003) Folk Psychiatry: Lay Thinking about Mental Disorder. *Social Research*, 70(2), 621- 644
- Capgras J, Reboul-Lachaux. (1994) L'illusion des 'sosies' dans un délire systématisé chronique. *History of Psychiatry* (1923), 5, 119-33.

#### Further reading

- Murphy D. (2014) Natural kinds in folk psychology and in psychiatry. In *Classifying Psychopathology: Mental Kinds and Natural Kinds*. (Eds. H. Kinciad & J.A. Sullivan), The MIT Press, pp. 105-22.

## **Week 5: Mental Disorder & Culture I: Key Issues**

Mohammed Rashed

### *Core reading*

- Summerfield, D. (2008). How scientifically valid is the knowledge base of Global Mental Health? *British Medical Journal* 336(7651): 992-994
- Littlewood, R. (1990). From categories to contexts: a decade of the “new cross-cultural psychiatry”. *British Journal of Psychiatry* 156: 308-327
- Radden, J. (2003). Is This Dame Melancholy? Equating Today's Depression and Past Melancholia. *Philosophy, Psychiatry, and Psychology* 10(1):37-52

### *Further reading*

- Kleinman, A. (1987). Anthropology and psychiatry. *British Journal of Psychiatry* 151: 447-454
- Kirmayer, L. (2006). Beyond the 'New Cross-cultural Psychiatry': Cultural Biology, Discursive Psychology, and the Ironies of Globalisation. *Transcultural Psychiatry* 43(1): 126-144

## **Week 6: Are Mental Disorders Brain Disorders?**

Derek Bolton

### *Core reading*

- White PD, Rickards H, Zeman. (2012). Time to end the distinction between mental and neurological illnesses. *BMJ*;344:e3454.
- Bolton, D. (2013). Should mental disorders be regarded as brain disorders?: 21st century mental health sciences and implications for research and training. *World Psychiatry*, 12, 24-25.
- Cuthbert BN(2014) Research Domain Criteria matrix. *World Psychiatry*, 13, 28-35.

### *Further reading*

- Banner, N. (2013). Mental disorders are not brain disorders. *Journal of Evaluation in Clinical Practice*, 19, 509-513. Commentaries on Cuthbert's target article (2014):
- Wakefield, J. (2014). Wittgenstein's nightmare: why the RDoC grid needs a conceptual dimension. *World Psychiatry*, 13, 38-40.
- M.R. Phillips (2014) Will RDoC hasten the decline of America's global leadership role in mental health?, *World Psychiatry*, 13, 40-41.

## **Week 7: Naturalist Definitions Of Mental Disorder (1): Biostatistical Theory**

Derek Bolton

### *Core Reading*

- Boorse, C. (1975) “On the distinction between disease and illness.” *Philosophy and Public Affairs*, 5:49- 68. Also in M. Cohen, T. Nagel and T. Scanlon. (eds) *Medicine and Moral Philosophy*. Princeton: Princeton University Press. 1981. p.49-68.
- Kingma, E. (2013) Naturalist accounts of mental disorder. In *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy and Psychiatry*. Edited W. K. M. Fulford, Martin Davies, Richard G.T. Gipps, George Graham, John Z. Sadler, G. Stanghellini, & Tim Thornton. Oxford University Press, 434-50.

### *Further reading*

- Boorse C. (2011) Concepts of Health & Disease. In *Philosophy of Medicine*, Ed. F. Gifford, pp.13-64, Oxford: Elsevier.

## **Week 8: Naturalist Definitions Of Mental Disorder (2): Evolutionary Theoretic Dysfunction**

Derek Bolton

### *Core reading*

- Wakefield, J.C. (1992) 'The concept of mental disorder: on the boundary between biological facts and social values.' *American Psychologist*, 47: 373-388. (electronic)
- Bolton, D. (2013) What is mental illness? In *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy and Psychiatry*. Edited W. K. M. Fulford, Martin Davies, Richard G.T. Gipps, George Graham, John Z. Sadler, G. Stanghellini, & Tim Thornton. Oxford University Press, 434-50.

### *Further reading*

- Cosmides, L and Tooby, J. (1999) Toward an Evolutionary Taxonomy of Treatable Conditions. *Journal of Abnormal Psychology*, 108, 453-464.
- Kendell R.E. (1975). The concept of disease and its implications for psychiatry. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, 127, 305-15.
- Richters, J.E. and Hinshaw, S.P. (1999) The Abduction of Disorder in Psychiatry. *Journal of Abnormal Psychology*, 108, 438-445.
- Wakefield, J.C. (1992) 'Disorder as a harmful dysfunction: a conceptual critique of DSM-III-R's definition of mental disorder.' *Psychological Review*, 99.2: 232-247.

## **Week 9: Mental Disorder & Culture II: Boundaries of Illness**

Mohammed Rashed

### *Core reading*

- Marková IS, Berrios GE. (2012). Epistemology of psychiatry. *Psychopathology* 45:220-227
- Barrett, R. (2004). Kurt Schneider in Borneo: Do first rank symptoms apply to the Iban? In *Schizophrenia, Culture & Subjectivity*, eds. J. Jenkins and R. Barrett, 87-109. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Kleinman, A. (2012). Culture, Bereavement, and Psychiatry. *The Lancet* 379(9816): 608-609

### *Further reading*

- Rashed, M.A. (2013). Psychiatric Judgements Across Cultural Contexts: Relativist, Clinical-Ethnographic, and Universalist-Scientific Perspectives. *Journal of Medicine & Philosophy* 38: 128-148
- Kleinman, A. (1999) Experience and its Moral Modes: Culture, Human Conditions, and Disorder. *The Tanner Lectures on Human Values* (pp: 389-420).

## **Week 10: The Origins And Evolution Of The Mainstream Conceptualisations Of Mental Disorder In The Dsm And The Icd**

Derek Bolton

### *Core reading*

- Spitzer R.L and Williams J B (1982). The definition and diagnosis of mental disorder. In WR Grove (ed.), *Deviance and mental illness*, pp. 15-31. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Bolton, D. (2008). What is Mental Disorder? An Essay in Philosophy, Science, and Values. Oxford, Oxford University Press. Sections 1.5 & 4.1

### *Further reading*

- Spitzer, R.L. & Endicott, I. (1978) Medical and mental disorder: proposed definition and criteria. In: *Critical issues in psychiatric diagnosis*. R.L.Spitzer & D.F. Klein, eds. New York, Raven Press: 15-40.
- Stein DJ, Phillips KA, Bolton D, Fulford KWM, Sadler J Z., Kendler KS. (2010) What is a Mental/Psychiatric Disorder? From DSM-IV to DSM-V. *Psychological Medicine*. 40, 1–7.

### QUESTIONS FOR FORMATIVE ESSAY

1. Explain and critically evaluate the conceptualization of mental disorder in the DSM-IV.
2. Explain what is meant by a 'naturalist' account of mental disorder and what motivates this approach. Critically evaluate one naturalist position – either Boorse's biostatistical theory or Wakefield's harmful dysfunction analysis
3. Give arguments for and against regarding impairment of social functioning as essential to mental disorders. What is your view of the matter and how would you defend it from criticisms?
4. Assess the claim that 'madness' is a sociopolitical identity and not a disorder of the mind. Include in your assessment an evaluation of the analogy between 'Mad Pride' and 'Gay Pride'. Whichever position you arrive at, defend it against possible objections.
5. Evaluate the claim that mental disorders have a universal basis (understood as an underlying dysfunction or core phenomenology) obscured by culturally-variant expressions/illness behaviours.
6. How are folk attributions of illness arrived at? How far is psychiatry from folk psychiatry?
7. Is mental disorder over-diagnosed? Explain how you arrive at your conclusion, what criticisms it faces, and how you will defend against these criticisms.
8. Describe the different ways in which culture defines/limits the domain of health-care. What, if any, are the implications of this for debates surrounding the concept of mental disorder?
9. Are mental disorders brain disorders? Explain how you arrive at your conclusion, what criticisms it faces, and how you will defend against these criticisms.